To

The Registrar Environment Court Christchurch



The Wolds Station Limited appeals the decision of the Mackenzie District Council on proposed Plan Change 13 to the Mackenzie District Plan.

The Appellant lodged submissions on the Plan Change.

Notice of the decision was received on or about the 9 September 2009.

The part of the decision that this appeal concerns is:

- (a) The whole decision
  - in particular, but not limited to
- (b) The decision that the maximum reflectivity index of the exterior of any buildings be 40% or less.
- (c) 3.5.1 the decision on Amenity tree planting within a farm base area to exclude P nigra and P. menzeii.
- (d) The decision to leave out from the farm base areas on The Wolds Station, the area at Windy Ridges.

The reasons for the appeal are

The plan change has failed to identify the outstanding natural landscapes within the zone and protect these, but has put controls zone wide. The landscape assessment by Mr Graham Demsem was incomplete and flawed.

The Council has not applied the Resource Management Act correctly because it puts rules on land that does not require landscape protection.

The section 32 analysis is incorrect, and has not taken account of the effect of the plan change on the farming community.

The commissioners fail to give adequate reasons for rejecting submissions and further submissions.

The reflectivity be 40% or less for building is to high. A tussock coloured painted weatherboard would not comply.

P nigra and P. menzeii are in common use and don't have any greater potential of spread than P. ponderosa which is not on the list. There are very limited species of trees we are able to grow.

The appellants seek the following relief from the court

Either, or a combination of the following:

The rule on reflectivity for building be removed

Pinus nigra and Pinus menzeii be removed from the list of prohibited species for farm base areas

Windy Ridges be included in The Wolds Station's farm base area.

Such further or other relief as may be rational and applicable having regard to all the circumstances and to achieve a rational zone change.

The plan change be abandoned

J B Murray

Authorised to sign on behalf of the appellant

Address for Service of appellant:

The Wolds Station Limited

PO Box 154

Lake Tekapo

Phone 03)6806608, 0272941443

Email thewolds@farmside.co.nz

Contact person JB Murray

The following documents are attached to this notice:

- (a) A copy of the submissions made by the appellant
- (b) A copy of the list of names and addresses of persons to be served with a copy of this notice.

Advice to recipiants of copy of notice of appeal

You may be a party to the appeal if you made a submission on the matter of this appeal and you lodge a notice and you lodge a notice of your wish to be a party to the proceedings (in form 33) with the Environment Court within 30 working days after this notice was lodged with the Environment Court.

You may apply too the Environment Court under section 281 of the resource Management Act 1991 for a waiver of the above timing requirements (see form 38).

## Advice

If you have any questions about this notice, contact the Environment Court Unit of the Department for courts in Auckland, Wellington or Christchurch

## THE WOLDS STATION LTD

The Wolds
PO Box 154
Lake Tekapo
03)6806608
thewolds@farmside.co.nz

October 16, 2009

Mackenzie District Council PO Box 52 Fairlie

Submission on the proposed Plan Change 13 to the Mackenzie District Plan.

The Company wishes to be heard in support of it's submission.

We submit that the proposed plan change be withdrawn and rewritten for the following reasons:-

That PC 13 is too prescriptive and is not effects based as the RMA requires. The Plan Change fails to identify the outstanding and natural landscapes present in the basin (as the existing District plan does), it just puts controls on the whole basin. The concept of building nodes is flawed, out of date and has case law against it. I believe this plan change was driven predominantly by interests outside of the district including DOC and Ecan and a plan change as controlling as this is not wanted by the community who lives here and pay the bills.

The identification of the white area (Attachment 3) in which all building except a remote farm accessory building is non complying has not been accurately defined. There are large parts of the white area in which buildings could be placed with no or minimal impact on landscape when viewed from public roads. Similarly large parts of the white areas are quite highly modified by existing trees and buildings. Why are these examples given the protection normally given to outstanding natural landscapes. (see attached photographs)

The Council is seeking to control all building in terms of design, shape and appearance when clearly that is unnecessary over a great part of the Mackenzie Basin where a building would not be visible. All building, subdivision, earthworks and tracking in the

Mackenzie sub-zone would require an expensive and time consuming resource consent. We currently have consents from both Ecan and LINZ for earthworks and tracking associated with irrigation and now will need a consent from the MDC to continue. If any control on tracking and earthworks is required, it should only be in the really outstanding parts of the landscape, ie the scenic viewing areas and lakeside protection areas in the existing plan.

The section 32 analysis does not examine the economic reality we face as farmers or the negative economic impact PC 13 would have. We will face increased costs from the delays in obtaining resource consents as well as the actual costs of the consents. If we are unsuccessful we bear the opportunity cost as well. We have to be able to change to survive economically and I fear the prescriptive nature of PC 13 would potentially stifle the unforeseen changes we need to make. The controls are unjustified and overly complex and would limit the our ability to adequately fund the stewardship role we currently undertake. The benefits of landscape protection won't be much use to us as farmers if we are financially not viable. DOC spends \$400,000 annually on wilding trees on its estate in the Mackenzie and openly admits this is insufficient.

The potential for subdivision and residential building allowed by the identified landscape sub areas and building nodes is in reality nonexistent. Because they are well away from roads and services the cost of development would far exceed the potential sale revenue. They would be hard to sell tucked away in hollows surrounded by trees away from water and little view. Screening with trees should only be required to reduce or break up visibility from a public place. Public access for 6 or more sections would drive purchasers away who value privacy and would greatly extend the area requiring landscape protection. (ie. thanks for nothing)

Farm buildings should be exempt from any plan change. There is currently minimal problem with inappropriate farm building and again the best landscapes are protected by scenic viewing areas and lakeside protection areas which should be retained in the plan. The concept of remote farm accessory buildings should be dropped as it would be hard to define what qualifies based on function. For example a grain silo needs to be accessible by a heavy truck and near a highway, but would store grain equally well anywhere. Any other farm or non residential building if not in a homestead node would need a non-complying consent or the creation of a node. This is too restrictive, unfair and far more restrictive than the Queenstown plan which allows a farm building as a permitted activity every 50 Ha provided the property is over 100 Ha. This means that the Queenstown Lakes District Council accepts that farm buildings are a legitimate farm activity and are not restricted to design, appearance or location.

The Wolds station owns two freehold sections at Windy Ridges on State highway 8 which would be in a proposed white zone. This means the plan change would make any new building non-complying. One section has no building on it and is now probably valueless. The area is clearly not natural with a large number of trees and buildings and

we submit it should be a building node. (see attached Photographs). If the building node concept is continued with the company would require these two sections totalling 21 Ha be designated a building node. We would also require the homestead node to be extended out to within 50 meters of state highway 8 between the existing fences because it is uneconomic to replace the bridge into the current homestead node.

The provision of one or more nodes over several properties is unjust, nodes should be allocated to a particular property.

We would also submit that the changes required to make this plan change workable are so great that the final version of PC 13 would be little resemblance to the draft. This means that people who have not submitted to this draft but who would have wished to have submitted on what the final version contains are unable to do so. For this reason as well PC 13 should be withdrawn

If PC 13 is not withdrawn then we submit that the Mackenzie District Council make such further additional, amended or consequential changes to any relevant part of the District Plan as are considered necessary to address the issues and concerns raised in this submission.

Signed

J. B. Murray

On behalf of The Wolds Station Limited

Mackenzie District Council C/- P O Box 52 FAIRLIE 7949

Classic Properties Ltd Martin Murray Maryburn Station Private Bag FAIRLIE 7949

Andrew Simpson Balmoral Station P O Box 91 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Tasman Downs Station Ian Hayman P O Box 17 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Trustees Est RH Simpson H J Simpson Mt Hay Station P O Box 16 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Braemar Station Ltd Julia Mackenzie P O Box 62 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Helen Simpson Mt Hay P O Box 16 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

JG & CA Murray Family Trust Jim Murray P O Box 12 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 CS & PJ Stott c/- MJ de Buyzer Berry & Co P O Box 12 OAMARU 9444

Rhoborough Downs Ltd Nicola Hornsey P O Box 17 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Ruataniwha Farm Ltd c/- Andrew Hocken P O Box 17202 Greenlane AUCKLAND 1546 Emily & Will Murray Glenmore Stationn P O Box 97 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Robert Preston Rhoborough Downs Private Bag FAIRLIE 7925 Donna Marie Falconer 46 Tekapo Drive TWIZEL 7901

Bruce Pipe P O 737 TIMARU 7940

Martin Galley 201 Mackenzie Drive TWIZEL 7901

Glentanner Station Ltd Mr Ross Ivey P O Box 23 MOUNT COOK 7946

Dr Dugald McDonald 62 School Road FAIRLIE 7925

Federated Farmers – South Canterbury R Douglas P O Box 665 TIMARU 7940

Federated Farmers – High Country Industry Group Bob Douglas P O Box 665 TIMARU 7940 Simons Pass Station Ltd & Pukaki Irrigat Company Ltd c/- Goodman Steven Tavendale Reid A C Limmer P O Box 442 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 NZ Defence Force c/- Rob Owen Private Bag 902 UPPER HUTT 5140 Simons Hill Station Ltd Denis Fastier Private Bag FAIRLIE 7949 Mackenzie District Council c/- Glen Innes P O Box 52 FAIRLIE 7949

Mackenzie District Council c/- Glen Innes P O Box 52 FAIRLIE 7949 Mt Gerald Station Ltd Michael Burtscher P O Box 81 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Fairlie Branch South Canterbury Federal Farmers of New Zealand c/- Stan Taylor Morelea RD 17 FAIRLIE 7987

W E Robinson & W J Ellery c/- Alan Clark P O Box 47-587 Ponsonby AUCKLAND 1144 Rangi Ruru Rowing Parents c/- David McLernon 15 Snowdon Road CHRISTCHURCH 8052 John Maxwell Phillips 852a Avonside Drive CHRISTCHURCH 8061

John Harvey Blair 15 Allum Street Kohimarama AUCKLAND 1071 Irishman Creek Station Ltd Justin Wills Private Bag 910 TIMARU 7940

New Zealand Transport Agency Colin Knaggs P O Box 1479 CHRISTCHURCH 8140

Ross Brewer & Diana Brewer 123 Caulfield Ave Clarence Gdns South Australia 5039 AUSTRALIA Willem Johan & Pauline Joan Beekhuis 15 Harcourt Street DUNEDIN 9011 Oskar & Karoline Reider c/- White Fox & Jones T W Evatt P O Box 1353 CHRISTCHURCH 8140

Christian Burtscher c/- White Fox & Jones T W Evatt P O Box 1353 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Tekapo Ski Area Ltd c/- White Fox & Jones T W Evatt P O Box 1353 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Mackenzie Branch Federated Farmers o Zealand c/- J B Murray The Wolds Station Private Bag FAIRLIE

The Wolds Station Ltd c/- J B Murray P O Box 154 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 H M Murray & B R Murray The Wolds Station P O Box 154 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

Roberta Preston Rhoborough Downs Private Bag FAIRLIE Sarah Preston Rhoborough Downs Station Private Bag FAIRLIE

Mrs Marion Seymour Ferintosh Station Private Bag FAIRLIE Mrs Marion Seymour Ferintosh Station Private Bag FAIRLIE

Bruce White 50 Rhoboro Road TWIZEL 7901

Grant & Natasha Hocken P O Box 70 TWIZEL 7944 The Mackenzie Experience Ltd c/- Grant Hocken P O Box 70 TWIZEL 7944

High Country Properties Ltd c/- Grant Hocken P O Box 70 TWIZEL 7944

Sawdon Station c/- RW & AF Allan, GDW Loxton & SAR Allan P O Box 9 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 Bendrose Station P O Box 84 TWIZEL 7944

Frank Hocken P O Box 100 TWIZEL 7944

Malcolm & Karan McDiarmid Aspen Court Motel 10 Mackenzie Drive TWIZEL 7901 Guide Hill Station c/- David Richard & Marion Patricia Goul Braemar Road LAKE TEKAPO

N & C Lyons Family Trust c/- N J Lyons 544a Great King Street DUNEDIN 9016 Mark Urquhart Grays Hills Private Bag FAIRLIE

Alistair Shearer 9 Bradley Street TIMARU 7910

Department of Conservation c/- Cheryl Colley Private Bag 4715 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Brent Ramsay & Jason Dickson 80 Oakwood Ave DUNEDIN 9011 Lone Star Farms Ltd c/- Rata Consulting Ltd 5 Ernlea Terrace Cashmere CHRISTCHURCH 8022

Star Holdings Ltd c/- Rata Consulting Ltd 5 Ernlea Terrace Cashmere CHRISTCHURCH 8022 South Canterbury Branch of Royal Forest & Bird Protection Society of NZ c/- Fraser Ross 29a Nile Street TIMARU 7910

Julie Pascoe 420 Montreal Street Central City CHRISTCHURCH 8013 Glenrock Station Ltd c/- Ann Scanlan P O Box 421 WANAKA 9343 New Zealand Forest Establishment Ltd Justine Ashley c/- Planit R W Batty & Associates Ltd P O Box 1845 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Aoraki Trust Lands Ltd c/- Bob Macintyre P O Box 74111 Market Rd AUCKLAND 1543

Ken & Jane Wigley Glen Lyon Station P O Box 11 TWIZEL 7944 Gillian Pollock 44 Aranui Road Mapua NELSON 0602 Haldon Station Ltd c/- Green Group Ltd Martin G Green P O Box 105 153 AUCKLAND 1143

Meridian Energy Ltd c/- Boffa Miskell Rochelle Hardy P O Box 110 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Meridian Energy Ltd c/- Boffa Miskell Rochelle Hardy P O Box 110 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Canterbury Aoraki Conservation Board c/- Brenda Preston Dept of Conservation Private Bag 4715 CHRISTCHURCH 8140

Coldwater Group c/- Caleb Ballin P O Box 41039 Ferrymead CHRISTCHURCH 8247 Environment Canterbury c/- Vin Smith P O Box 345 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Sue Keen Shaelaburn RD 2 OUTRAM 9074

L Brown Shaelaburn RD 2 OUTRAM 9074

Krista Curin P O Box 142 TWIZEL 7944 Michael & Elaine Lindsay Omahau Hill P O Box 155 TWIZEL 7944

Lana Hastie P O Box 57 TWIZEL 7944 High Country Rosehip Orchards Ltd c/- Vivian & Espie Ltd P O Box 2514 Wakatipu QUEENSTOWN 9349 Mackenzie Lifestyle Ltd c/- Vivian & Espie Ltd P O Box 2514 Wakatipu QUEENSTOWN 9349

Hocken Lane Land Owners Association c/- The Secretary Pauline Beekhuis 15 Harcourt Street DUNEDIN 9011

Fountainblue Ltd, Southern Serenity Ltd & Pukaki Tourism Holdings Partnership c/- Vivian & Espie Ltd Claire Le Grice P O Box 79 TWIZEL 7944

Andrew Eccleshall P O Box 79 TWIZEL7944 Josh Billings & Ann Barton 25 Maffeys Road Mt Pleasant CHRISTCHURCH 8081 Steven Rhodes 15 Jasper Way Springfield Lakes Brisbane QUEENSLAND 4300

Ethan Gabriel 398 Mount Cook Highway TWIZEL

South Island Rowing Inc The Secretary P O Box 3261 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Frank Hocken P O Box 100 TWIZEL 7944

Frank Hocken P O Box 100 TWIZEL 7944

Transpower New Zealand Limited C/- Burton Planning Consultants Ltd PO Box 33-817 Takapuna AUCKLAND 0740

NZ Historic Places Trust c/- Joanne Easterbrook Heritage Advisor P O Box 4403 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 Sean Jones Omahau Station P O Box 50 TWIZEL 7944

Connie Heath 265 Mackenzie Drive TWIZEL 7901

David Scott P O Box 115 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 Marion Gould Guide Hill Station P O Box 55 LAKE TEKAPO 7945

S A Bowers 52 Rata Road TWIZEL 7901 Ross Carrick C/- Moyles Pharmacy 6 Dee Street TIMARU 7910 Peter Bell 11 Sloane Street FAIRLIE 7925

NZ Fire Service C/- Beca Carter Holdings P O Box 13 960 CHRISTCHURCH 8141 EO & JE Sullivan Raymond Sullivan McGlashan P O Box 557 TIMARU 7940 Ursula Krebs PO Box 545 WANAKA 9343

Te Runanga o Ngai Tahu PO Box 13046 CHRISTCHURCH 8141 Murray Ewans 2 Glencairn Road TWIZEL 7901 lan Lintott P O Box 169 TWIZEL 7940 Dean Smith c/- 6 Holmes Street WAIMATE 7924

Gottlieb & Anne Braun-Elwert PO Box 75 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 Ralph Smith & I R Smith Family Trust 151 Saddle Hill Road 1 RD DUNEDIN 9076

Jim & Anne Murray P O Box 12 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 Ken & Glenda Robinson 42 Brooks View Heights Tasman RD 1 UPPER MOUTERE 7173 Brenda Agnew P O Box 140 TWIZEL 7940

Lake Tekapo Community Board c/- Peter Maxwell P O Box 1 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 DJ & JL Rayner 53 Jollie Road TWIZEL 7901 C Hughes & Associates Ltd c/- Nicola Scott P O Box 599 WANAKA 9343

Craig Aaron Robinson Mawheraiti Postal Centre GREYMOUTH 7839 A H Hunter C\- White Fox & Jones T W Evatt PO Box 1353 CHRISTCHURCH 8140 K M Lane 121 Deans Ave Riccarton CHRISTCHURCH 8011

A J Phillips 45 Collingwood Street NELSON 7010 Brett.J.Robinson (Nettlebed Family Trust) 42 Brooks View Heights, R.D.1 Upper Moutere Nelson 7173 M Bakker-Gelsing 854 Fairview Road RD 2 TIMARU 7972

Valasay Properties Ltd 20 Royds Street Fendalton CHRISTCHURCH 8014 Simon & Priscilla Cameron Ben Ohau Station P O Box 95 TWIZEL 7944 Angela Robinson 459A North End Road Fulham London UNITED KINGDOM SW6 1NZ

Phil Rive 68 Mackenzie Drive TWIZEL 7901 Karen Simpson Balmoral Station P O Box 91 LAKE TEKAPO 7945 Shaun Norman 21 Godley Street TWIZEL 7901 Twizel Community Board c/- John Bishop 76 Highview Tce St Andrews Park QUEENSTOWN9300

Sam Bosshard & Jen Purdie P O Box 53 TWIZEL 7944

PGG Wrightson Ltd c/- Chris Adam P O Box 521 TIMARU 7940

Canterbury/Aoraki Conservation Board c/- Brenda Preston Department of Conservation Private Bag CHRISTCHURCH

Andrew Dyer 2 Westminster Place Rototuna HAMILTON 3210

Seeam Ghoorah & Daim Ghoorah P O Box 12 TWIZEL 7944

